



BN52416436

DEFENCE FOI 116/22/23 STATEMENT OF REASONS UNDER THE FREEDOM OF INFORMATION ACT

1. I refer to the application by [REDACTED] under the *Freedom of Information Act 1982* (FOI Act) for access to:

“Following the release of Defence FOI 459/21/22, which included document SB21-001257 titled, “Unidentified Aerial Phenomena CAF BRIEF”, please be advised that I wish to submit the following FOI request:

I kindly request all versions of the document, “Unidentified Aerial Phenomena CAF BRIEF”, including the initial draft, all revised versions and the latest available update.”

FOI decision maker

2. I am the authorised officer pursuant to section 23 of the FOI Act to make a decision on this FOI request.

Documents identified

3. I identified eight documents as matching the description of the request.
4. The decision in relation to each document is detailed in a schedule of documents.
5. I have added an FOI reference number and item/document number to each of the documents, which corresponds with the schedule.

Exclusions

6. Personal email addresses, signatures, PMKeyS numbers and mobile telephone numbers contained in documents that fall within the scope of the FOI request, duplicates of documents, and documents sent to or from the applicant are excluded from this request.

Decision

7. I have decided to:
 - a. partially release eight documents in accordance with section 22 [access to edited copies with exempt or irrelevant matter deleted] of the FOI Act, on the grounds that the deleted material is considered exempt under section 47E(c) [public interest conditional exemptions-certain operations of agencies] and section 47F [public interest conditional exemptions-personal privacy] of the FOI Act; and
 - b. remove irrelevant material under section 22 of the FOI Act.

Material taken into account

8. In making my decision, I had regard to:
 - a. the terms of the request;
 - b. the content of the identified documents in issue;
 - c. relevant provisions in the FOI Act; and

- d. the Guidelines published by the Office of the Australian Information Commissioner under section 93A of the FOI Act (the Guidelines).

Reasons for decision

Section 47E – Certain operations of agencies

9. Upon examination of the documents, I identified eight documents containing information relating to Defence personnel, including names and ranks. Subsections 47E(c) of the FOI Act states:

A document is conditionally exempt if its disclosure under this Act would, or could reasonably be expected to, do any of the following:

(c) have a substantial adverse effect on the management or assessment of personnel by the Commonwealth or by an agency;

10. The Australian Information Commissioner has issued Guidelines under section 93A to which regard must be had for the purposes of performing a function, or exercising a power, under the FOI Act. In relation to subsection 47E(c) of the FOI Act, the Guidelines explain that, where the document relates to the agency's policies and practices relating to the assessment and management of personnel, the decision maker must address whether:

- a. an effect would reasonably be expected following disclosure; and
- b. the expected effect would be both substantial and adverse.

11. For this exemption to apply, the documents must relate to either:

- i. the management of personnel – including the broader human resources policies and activities, recruitment, promotion, compensation, discipline, harassment and occupational health and safety; and
- ii. the assessment of personnel – including the broader performance management policies and activities concerning competency, in-house training requirements, appraisals and underperformance, counselling, feedback, assessment for bonus or eligibility for progression.

12. The information contained within the document included information that identified personnel who have been involved, or contributed, in the preparation of Senate Estimate Brief SB21-001257 and material relating to Unidentified Flying Objects or Unidentified Aerial Phenomena. Releasing this information could reasonably be expected to increase the likelihood of these individuals being contacted directly, or harassed, regarding their involvement in the subject matter.

13. In conclusion, I am satisfied that the documents are conditionally exempt under section 47E(c) of the FOI Act.

Public interest considerations – Section 47E

14. In assessing whether disclosure is on balance, contrary to the public interest, I considered the Guidelines together with a range of factors set out in section 11B(3) of the FOI Act, which favours access to a document:

- a. *promote the objects of this Act (including all the matters set out in sections 3 and 3A);*
- b. *inform debate on a matter of public importance;*
- c. *promote effective oversight of public expenditure;*

d. allow a person to access his or her own personal information

15. I note that disclosure of the requested documents may promote some of the objects of the FOI Act, as information held by the Government is a national resource. However, disclosure of the specific conditionally exempt material would not increase public participation in the Defence process, nor would it increase scrutiny or discussion of Defence activities.

16. Paragraph 6.22 of the Guidelines specifies a non-exhaustive list of public interest factors against disclosure. The factors I find particularly relevant to this request are that release of this information could reasonably be expected to prejudice or harm:

- a. the protection of an individual's right to privacy;
- b. the interests of an individual or group of individuals; and/or
- c. the management function of an agency.

17. While I consider that release of the material removed under sections 47E(c) may be of some interest to the applicant, disclosure of the conditionally exempt material would not inform public debate on any matter of public importance in any meaningful way. There is also a public interest in maintaining the confidentiality of the names and contact details of Defence personnel who assist in or prepare Senate Estimate Briefs. This public interest extends to Senate Estimate Brief SB21-001257, and material relating to Unidentified Flying Objects or Unidentified Aerial Phenomena, where there is an expectation that Defence manages personnel information in a sensitive way.

18. Noting the above, I consider that, on balance the public interest factors against disclosure outweigh the factors for disclosure. I have therefore decided that it would be contrary to the public interest to release the information considered exempt under subsection 47E(c) of the FOI Act


19. None of the factors listed in section 11B(4) [Irrelevant Factors] of the FOI Act were taken into account when making this decision.

Further Information

20. Due to the formatting of the template used for SB21-001257 the dates found in the footer of each document are not an accurate reflection of when the document was last edited or updated.

21. As per the scope of the request, draft versions of SB21-001257 are being released. The draft versions of the document have not been approved for clearance, and the information contained in those drafts cannot be relied upon.

22. The Department of Defence does not have a protocol for reporting or recording of Unidentified Aerial Phenomena (UAP) or Unidentified Flying Object (UFO). The Air Force ceased handling reports of UAP or UFO in 1996 after determining there was no scientific or other compelling reason for the Air Force to continue to devote resources to the recording and investigation of UAP or UFO.



Group Captain
Accredited Decision Maker
Royal Australian Air Force